

Notes to

“Illusion and Reality of Civil Society in Iran: An Ideological Debate”

Ladan Boroumand and Roya Boroumand

Published in “Iran Since the Revolution.” *Social Research* Vol. 67 No. 2

(Summer 2000) pp. 303-344. © 2000 Social Research.

* We would like to thank Laila Alhamad, Azar Nafisi, Marc F. Plattner and Zerxes Spencer for their useful critiques and suggestions in the preparation of this manuscript.

(1) “You do not need higher education to be an insider... There is no need to be good, honest, and truthful to be an insider... Experience and competence are not required to become an insider... What matters most for an insider is to have connections... To be related... is the necessary condition for becoming an insider... public monies are the property of the insiders, and the outsiders are not entitled to it,” Khomei, A. “The Iranian Insiders and the Iranian Outsiders,” *Gozarash* 97-98, (Mar.-Apr. 1999 [farvardin 1378]): 67-70.

(2) That is how the regime's dignitaries justify this dichotomy: “The debate on insiders and outsiders has its roots in Islam. The prophet's family has defined the norms and attributes distinguishing insiders and outsiders. Our people, our youth in particular, must be aware... The enemy wishes to suppress the barrier between the insiders and the outsiders. The enemy wants to come in under the guise of the insiders... and make our surprised youth say that there is no barrier. No my brother, it is not so.” Rayshahri, M. Friday sermon of 4 Feb. 2000 at Tehran University, *Fatth*, (5 Feb. 2000 [16/11/1378]). On the distinction between first class and second class citizenship see, Mesbah Yazdi, M. T., member of Khebragan Majlis (Assembly that elects the Supreme Leader), *Arya*, (19 Dec. 1998 [28/9/1377]). In the minds of ordinary citizens, the distinction between insiders and outsiders is as follows: “Those who divide people into two categories, insiders and outsiders, separate men ... into two species: men with divine attributes and those with evil attributes. Nothing links

these two species together ... Insiders enjoy all constitutional and civil rights and benefit from the privileges of *citizenship*... Outsiders must pass an ideological and moral test before they can be employed or continue with their studies... Outsiders are not authorized to publish newspapers or books. They do not have the right to produce films or organize themselves into political parties. They are never promoted to high managerial positions... They cannot be candidates in presidential or legislative elections. They cannot even organize funerals for their dead... Outsiders have the right only to participate in the elections of insiders..." Mohammadi, M. "The Foundation of the Two Concepts of Insiders and Outsiders," *Iran Farda* 43, (May-Jun. 1998 [khordad 1377]): 10-12.

(3) Cohen, J. L. and Arato, A. *Civil Society and Political Theory*. The MIT Press, 1992: 18-26. See also, Diamond, L. "Rethinking Civil Society, Toward Democratic Consolidation", *Journal of Democracy* 5: 3 (3 July 1994): 5-6.

(4) See Gellner E., *Conditions of Liberty: Civil Society and Its Rivals*, Allen Lane (Penguin), 1994:188.

(5) This study underlines serious structural and legal constraints met by the NGOs. "This Ministry (Interior) is the key government agency involved in the registration of NGOs. However, NGOs and political parties undergo the same procedures for registration. The unit concerned with registration in this Ministry is more security oriented. Procedures are geared for security clearances more than anything else. If a NGO were to comply with all the procedures and requirements put out by this unit it would not be able to consider itself truly independent." Other Ministries issue permits to NGOs interested in their fields, sometimes with a less cumbersome process. Namazi, B. *Iranian NGOs: Situation Analysis*, Tehran, Jan. 2000: 35. "The presence of a large number of high-level government officials among the ranks of NGOs has created controversies... During group discussions, involving government representatives, NGOs endorsed the new vision and government policies... They also...described the structural constraints that were in contradiction to declared policies. In actual practice the NGOs continued to face very serious legal, registration management, structural, capacity building, and financial constraints... " Ibid: 49.

(6) IRNA 11 Jul. 1998. Karbaschi was sentenced to five years in prison, directed to pay a heavy fine and banned from holding public office for 20 years. *Reuters*, Tehran, 27 Jul. 1998. Eventually the Supreme Leader, pardoned Karbaschi who was released on January 24, 1999. *Monthly Payam-e Emrouz* 37, (Feb.-Mar. 1999 [esfand 1378]): 56.

(7) *Daily Salam*, (18 Mar. 1999 [28/12/1378]).

(8) "The students have called for the resignation of the police chief, whom they hold responsible for an attack on student dormitories which they say resulted in the death of seven students and injuries to more than 200. The government has confirmed only one death," *Reuters*, 18 Jul. 1999. "As for the exact number of the victims, said M.K. Koochi, Director of Tehran University dormitory, since I pledged to speak the truth, allow me not to answer this question." Interview. *Hamshahri*, (22 Jul. 1999 [31/4/1378]) The attack against the students of Tabriz University was even more violent. Tabriz University's Islamic Students Council said that at least 15 people were shot... A Council spokesman ...noted that some 80 people had already been injured by stones, clubs, and knives when security forces began opening fire into the crowd... Other vigilantes went to a local hospital and abducted those who had been wounded by gunfire." *Khordad*, (3 Aug. 1999 [12/5/1378]).

(9) *BBC NEWS*, 23 Jul. 1999.

(10) *AFP*, 25 Mar. 2000.

(11) See Kian, A. "La révolution iranienne à l'heure des réformes", in *Le Monde Diplomatique*, Jan. 1998. See also Bakhsh, Sh. "Iran's Unlikely President," *The New York Review of Books*, 5 Nov. 1998.

(12) It is worth noting that it was not the investigative authorities that first implicated the agents of the Ministry of the Interior in the killings of dissidents. About a month after the killings, a leak provided the daily *Salam* with the information. *Salam*, (5 Jan. 1999 [15/10/1377]). The Ministry of the Interior issued its communiqué a day later, *Hamshahri*, (6 Jan. 1999[16/10/1377]).

(13) Article 2. The Islamic Republic is a system based on the belief in: "1) The One God (...) His exclusive sovereignty and the right to legislate, and the necessity of submission to His commands; 2) Divine revelation and its fundamental role in setting forth the laws; 3) the return to God in the Hereafter, and the constructive role of this belief in the course of man's ascent towards God; 4) the justice of God in creation and legislation; 5) continuous leadership (imamat) and perpetual guidance, and its fundamental role in

ensuring the uninterrupted process of the revolution of Islam." The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Iran, General Principles, Section 1.

(14) Article 24 of the Constitution provides for freedom of expression "except when it is detrimental to the principles of Islam." In the Article 26, the Constitution guarantees citizens the freedom of association unless such associations violate "the criteria of Islam, or the basis of the Islamic Republic. "

(15) On January 16, 1996, 16 regime's technocrats, ten of them ministers, announced in a communiqué the creation of a coalition, "Servants of Reconstruction". For the history of the coalition see *Payam-e Emrooz* 37, esfand 1378 (Feb.-Mar. 2000): 64-66.

(16) Within Iran, at least 80 people are listed as victims of extra-judicial executions. See Khatami, M.R., "Engagement in Politics is costly in our country." Interview. *Fatth*, (12 Feb. 2000 [23/11/1378]). Outside Iran, at least as many as 114 people are believed to be victims of extrajudicial executions. In *Report on the Islamic Republic's Terrorism abroad*, Unpublished report, National Movement of Iranian Resistance, 1997. These numbers are not exhaustive and do not include disappearances.

(17) "Our interpretation of religion must not contradict the dignity and freedom of the people," Khatami, M., Speech in Yazd, *Hamshahri*, (6 Mar. 1999 [15/12/1377]).

(18) " Religious intellectuals ... must defend Islam in a way that would be acceptable to our youth and show that Islam can lead the world." Khatami, M. "Speech in Yazd," *Hamshahri*, (6 Mar 1999 [15/12/1377]).

(19) "Iran for all Iranians" is the electoral slogan of the pro-Khatami Islamic Iran Participation Party. Khatami's brother, Mohammad Reza, who heads the party, elaborates on the question of opening the circle of insiders. Interview. *Fatth*, (14 Feb. 2000 [25/11/1378]).

(20) Khatami's adviser insists that the demand for a civil society is not a rejection of the Guardianship of the Supreme Leader. Rabbii, A. *Fatth*, (6 Mar. 2000 [16/12/1378]). The constitution lists the prerogative of the Supreme Leader as follows : Section 8, Article 110. Following are the duties and powers of the Leadership: 1. Delineation of the general policies of the Islamic Republic of Iran after consultation with the Nation's Exigency Council. 2. Supervision over the proper execution of the

general policies of the system. 3. Issuing decrees for national referenda. 4. Assuming supreme command of the armed forces. 5. Declaration of war and peace, and the mobilization of the armed forces. 6. Appointment, dismissal, and acceptance of resignation of: a) the fuqaha' on the Guardian Council ; b) the supreme judicial authority of the country ; c) the head of the radio and television network of the Islamic Republic of Iran ; d) the joint chief of staff; e) the chief commander of the Islamic Revolution Guards Corps ; and f) the supreme commanders of the armed forces. 7. Resolving differences between the three wings of the armed forces and regulation of their relations. 8. Resolving the problems, which cannot be solved by conventional methods, through the Nation's Exigency Council. 9. Signing the decree formalizing the election of the President of the Republic by the people. The suitability of candidates for the presidency of the republic, with respect to the qualification specified in the Constitution, must be confirmed before elections take place by the Guardian Council, and, in the case of the first term [of the presidency], by the leadership; 10. Dismissal of the President of the Republic, with due regard for the interests of the country, after the Supreme Court holds him guilty of the violation of his constitutional duties, or after a vote of the Islamic Consultative Assembly testifying to his incompetence on the basis of Article 89 of the Constitution..."

(21) "A government consistent with religion and religious rule is one that proves that religion is not opposed to the dignity of humans or to their reasonable freedoms. He said religion argues that man does not need a guardian but that he does need a leader and an instructor." Khatami, M.: *IRNA*, Tehran, 5 Aug. 1998.

(22) "Young people who study extremely hard and attain important scientific successes cannot accept that, while they hardly make ends meet, ... the children of the ruling elite, who have barely finished high school, easily become extremely wealthy." Rabii, A., President Khatami's adviser on social affairs, *Fatth*, (6 Mar. 2000 [16/12/1378]).

(23) "A free press has a fundamental role and guarantees transparency, as does the freedom of thought. The visibility conferred to important sectors of society enables the authorities to cope more efficiently with realities". Khatami, M., meeting with the Minister of Information and the directors of the Ministry, *Salam*, (30 May 1999 [9/3/78]).

(24) Representative of Ardakan in the Majlis (Islamic parliament) (1980-82), head of the Majlis Committee on Foreign Relations; Supervisor of the Kayhan Publication Group (1980-82); member of the Central Committee of Friday Imams; Minister of Culture and Islamic Guidance (1982-92).

(25) " The condemnation to death of the author of *The Satanic Verses* and of all those who publish this work and contribute to its circulation represent the height of the Islamic Republic," Khatami M. *Salam*, (15 Feb. 1998 [26/11/1376]): 9. The fatwa against Rushdi was declared on 14 February 1989 [25/11/1367].

(26) Khatami, M. "A Glance at the Principle of "Guardianship of the Jurisprudent Islamology, the Necessary and Sufficient Condition, " *Kayhan*, (25 Nov. 1980 [4/9/1359]).

(27) Khatami, M. "The Islamic Revolution is the beginning of a new stage in the destiny of human beings." *Kayhan*, (Jul. 29, 1989[8/5/1368]).

(28) Khatami, M. "The Islamic Revolution is the beginning of a new stage in the destiny of human beings," *Kayhan*, (29 Jul. 1989 [8/5/1368]).

(29) Khatami, M. *Bim-e Moj* (Fear of Wave), Tehran, Simaye Javan, 1997: 98.

(30) Khatami, M. *Bim-e Moj* (Fear of Wave), Tehran, Simaye Javan, 1997:147.

(31) Khatami, M., *Bim-e Moj...*, *op. cit.*: 154-55.

(32) Ibid:152-53.

(33) Ibid: 160-61.

(34) Ibid: 205.

(35) Ibid: 198-99.

(36) This demonstration, which was authorized by the Ministry of Interior, took place on March 2, 1998. *Hamshahri*, (3 Mar. 1998 [12/12/1376]).

(37) See *Payam-e Emrooz* 24 (Jun.-Jul. 1998 [tir 1377]): 6365.

(38) Interviews of the students at the Universities of Esfahan, Mashhad, Yassouj, Shiraz, and Tehran. *Salam*, (10 Febr. 1999 [21/11/1377]).

(39) Vigilantes attacked the first demonstration, organized on 2 March 1998, while the security forces passively looked on. *Hamshari*, (3 Mar. 1998 [12/12/1376]). The events surrounding the Laleh park meeting of (25 May

1998[4/3/1377]) on municipal councils and the Assembly of Experts' elections is reported by a witness: "As for the security forces, instead of defending the demonstrators, they protected the assailants," *Payam-e Emrooz* 24, (June-July 1998 [tir 1377]): 63-65.

(40) From December 1997 through January 1998, students of the University of Tehran (3 January, 1998), Beheshty University (19 January 1998), and Tabriz University, among others, went on strike to protest against the poor conditions of cafeterias and dormitories. The authorities ignored their first efforts at negotiation. To have their voices heard, the students had to resort to violent actions like breaking the windows of the cafeteria. See "Students' Protest Extent and Characteristics" *Payam-e Emrooz* 23, (April-May 1998 [ordibehesht 1377]): 105-11.

(41) Ganji, A. *Sobeh-e Emrooz*, (21 Jul. 1999 [30/4/1378]).

(42) *Hamshahri*, (22 Jun. 1998 [1/4/ 1377]).

(43) Nouri, A. *Naghdi bar tamam-e Fosool, goftogooy-e Akbar Ganji ba Abdollah Nouri* (A critique for all seasons, conversation of Akbar Ganji with Abdullah Nouri), Tehran, Tarhe-No Publishing (second edition), 1999: 83.

(44) As for the silence of the Islamic Iran's Participation Front on the subject of the clergy's privileges, M. R. Khatami responded: "I think that this issue is not a priority in our society... We have a lot of problems in the cultural, social, political, athletic, and economic...fields. We cannot create a diversion on subsidiary issues. Questioned further on the necessity of following up on the cases of the assassinated dissidents, M.R. Khatami's response was evasive and unclear." *Fatth* (14 Feb. 2000, [25/11/1378]).

(45) See Amir Arjomand, S. *The Shadow of God and the Hidden Imam*, the University of Chicago Press, 1984, p. 268-70. See also Kadivar, M. *Anidshe-ye Siasi dar Eslam* (Political thinking in Islam), vol. 1, *Nazarieh hay-e dolat dar Fiqh-e shi'a* (theories of state in Shi'a Canon law), Tehran, Nashr-e Nay, 1999 (first edition 1997): 24-25.

(46) "The...doctrinal objections to the Velayat-e Faqih [Guardianship of the Jurisprudent] have been voiced by the Grand Ayatollahs Kho'i, Qomi, and Shari'at-madari....And by Ayatollahs Baha' al-Din Mahallati, Sadeq Ruhani, Ahmad Zanjani, Ali Tehrani, and Morteza Ha'eri Yazdi." Amir Arjomand, S. *The Turban for the Crown: The Islamic Revolution in Iran*, Oxford University Press, 1988: 156.

(47) On the persecution of high clerical authorities in the Islamic Republic of Iran, see Baghi E., "In Defense of Clerical Authority: Who are Those who Attack the Clergy?"; *Fatth*, (6 Feb. 2000 [17/11/1378]). See also Ganji, A. *Naghdi bar tamam-e Fosoul, goftogooy-e Akbar Ganji ba Abdollah Nouri (A critique for all seasons, conversation of Akbar Ganji with Abdollah Nouri)*, Tehran, Tarhe-No Publishing (second edition), 1999: 78.

(48) "The Shi'ite clergy, before and after the revolution, is composed of two minorities and one majority. A minority (A) supports the regime, the other minority (B) advocates religious reform." E. Baghi, "The Reformist Clergy," Speech at a seminar in Nicosia, *Neshat*, 28/4/1378 (19 Jul. 1999).

(49) Kadivar, M., jurist, theologian, professor of public law at Shahid Beheshti University. "The Theories of Government in Shi't Figh," translated by Hossein, M. in *Hikmat* 1:3-4, 1997-98: 303-29, 413-43.

(50) See Kadivar's conclusions in *Rahe No 15*, (1 Aug. 1998 [10/5/1377]): 35. M.Kadivar was arrested on February 28, 1999. *Hamshahri*, (1 Mar. 1999[10/12/1377]). Judged by the Special Court of Clergy, he was declared guilty of having "offended the Supreme Leader, weakened the Islamic Republic, and troubled the public mind." See *Payam-e Emrooz* 29, (Mar.-Apr. 1999 [farvardin 1378]):10-13.

(51) Said-Zadeh, M. "Let God Stay in Heaven?" *Jame'eh Salem* 38, (Apr.-May 1998 [ordibehesht 1378]): 65-67. The monthly *Jame'e-ye Salem* was closed down by the authorities in the summer 1998. Shortly after Said-Zadeh's article was published, he was arrested, kept in prison for several months, and then tried, defrocked, and released.

(52) Mojtabeh Shabestari, M. "Human Rights, the True Foundation of the Social Order", in *Neshat*, (22 May 1999[1/3/1378]).

(53) Haeri Yazdi, M. *Hekmat va Hokumat*, Shadi Publishing, 1995: 216.

(54) *Ibid*: 217.

(55) Khatami, M. *Bim-e Moj (Fear of the Wave)*, *op. cit*: 198-99.

(56) In a 25 January 2000 meeting with the Islamic Students Association's Central Council. *RFE/RL IRAN Report*, Samii, W. Extract 3: 6, 7 Feb. 2000 .

(57) "What We learn and What We Witness," Roundtable organized by the monthly *Jame'eh-Salem*: 38, (Apr.-May 1998 [ordibehesht 1377]): 37.

(58) *Payam-e Emrooz* 37, (Feb.-Mar. 2000 [esfand 1378]): 14.

(59) Kadivar, M., "The Result of Twenty Years of the Islamic Republic," conference in the Hossein Abad Mosque in Esfahan, *Payam-e Emrooz* 30 (Apr.-May 1999 [ordibehesht 1378]).

(60) Attorney Jabari, Z. *Salam*, (23 Feb. 1998 [4/12/1376]). On the downside of the islamization of the judiciary see Niknam, A., "Les revers de l'islamisation du Droit", *Les Cahiers de l'Orient* 49, 1998: 53-70.

(61) Kadivar, M., *Payam-e Emrooz* 28, (Feb.-Mar. 1999 [esfand 1377]): 19.

(62) Male law student, *Jame'eh-Salem* 38, (Apr.-May 1998 [ordibehesht 1377]): 39.

(63) *Jame'eh-Salem* 38, (Apr.-May 1998 [ordibehesht 1377]): 37.

(64) Mar'ashi, H., *Fatth*, (9 Mar. 2000 [19/12/1378]).

(65) Student of Tehran University, *Salam*, (10 Feb. 1999 [21/11/1377]).

(66) Soroush, A. Interview, *Reuters*, 9 Dec. 1997 Tehran, Iran.

(67) The weekly *Khaneh* was banned after the publication of this letter in its 15 July 1998 issue.

(68) Quoted by Kian, A., in " L'individu dans le monde: le paradoxe de l'Iran islamique," *Cemoti* 26, Paris, 1998: 177.

(69) *Azadi*, quoted in the weekly *Kayhan* 692, London, 29 Jan. 1998.

(70) *Kayhan*, 4/6/1378 (26 Aug. 1999).

(71) *NBC*, (26 Feb. 1999 [7/12/1377]).

(72) Contenta, S. "Reformers won the recent election, but conservatives still have a stronghand," *The Toronto Star*, 5 Mar. 2000.

(73) *Payam-e Emrooz* 31, (Jun-Jul 1999 [tir 1378]): 69.

(74) *Jame'eh-Salem*: 38, (Apr-May 1998 [ordibehesht 1377]): 40. In its program of action for the 2000 parliamentary elections, the coalition of reformist journalists and religious intellectuals included the establishment of a human rights commission in parliament to ensure the respect of human rights by the judicial power and the information services. *Asr Azadegan*, (15 Dec. 1999 [24/9/1378]).

(75) *Jame'eh-Salem* 38, (Apr-May 1998 [ordibehesht 1377]): 53.

(76) Rahchamani, M.R. the General Secretary of the pro-Khatami Islamic Iran's Solidarity Party, *Payam-e Emrooz* 35, (Nov.-Dec. 1999 [azar 1378]): 47.

(77) Ebadi, S., "Human Rights, Iran and International Commitments," *Jame'eh-Salem* 38, (Apr.-May 1998 [ordibehesht 1377]): 26-31.

(78) See Namazi, B., *Iranian NGOs: Situation Analysis*, Tehran, Jan. 2000: 34-35, 49-50.

(79) Pouyandeh's translation has become a reference in the public debate. See for instance *Fatth*, on Islam and human rights (20 Jan. 2000 [30/10/1378]).

(80) *Payam-e Emrooz* 27, (Dec.-Jan. 1999 [day 1377]).

(81) Tabarzadi, H., "If no action is taken today, tomorrow will be too late," *Open letter to the president*, 2 Jun 1999. Tabarzadi is an insider who headed for years the state sponsored student organization. He is the brother of two war martyrs and former director of two banned weeklies, "*Payam-e Daneshjoo*" and "*Hoviat e Kheesh*." The Council of Guardians rejected Tabarzadi's candidacy for the 2000 parliamentary elections.

(82) Authors' interview with Arash Forouhar, the son of Parvaneh and Dariouch Forouhar, 25 Jan. 1999.

(83) See R. Safavi, the commander of the Revolutionary Guards, *Payam-e Emrooz* 23, (Apr.-May 1998 [ordibehesht 1377]): 19. On 4 Oct. 1998, the deputy commander of Revolutionary Guards Zolqadr Salam, (12 Nov. 1998 [218/1377]). See also Nateq-Nouri, then speaker of the parliament, 22 Nov. 1998 *Hamshahri*, (23 Nov. 1998 [3/9/77]).

(84) *Reuters*, 11 Mar. 1999.

(85) The weekly *Rah-e No*, for example, publishes a series of articles devoted to Mossadeq, entitled "**Twenty eight months of a different kind.**" These articles quote Mossadeq extensively: "Democracy, which is realized through free elections, is our only salvation... If elections are free, people will, in general, make the best choice..." *Rah-e No*, 15, (1 Aug. 1998 [10/5/1377]): 26-27.

(86) King Cyrus the Great, the founder of the Achemenaid dynasty, and Mossadeq were mentioned in a resolution adopted by students gathered at Tehran University on (25 May 1999 [4/3/1378]) to demonstrate in support of political

prisoners, freedom of thought, and freedom of speech. The meeting resulted in numerous arrests. After his release from prison, one of the students noted that his interrogator had reproached him for evoking in the resolution the names of a king and Mossadeq, who was allegedly against the clergy. The student replied: "If the students chant the names of Satar or Cyrus the Great, it is because they are attached to their culture and origins. You should not change history, you cannot change it.. History shows that many kings have ruled Iran. They should be mentioned for their great achievements as much as for their evil deeds." Mohajeri-Nejad, Gh.. Interview. By Mohri, H. *Radio Seday-e Iran*, Los Angeles, 1 Jun. 1999.

(87) The Islamic association of University Students and Graduates, *A solution for Iran's future political structure, the untold story of the revolution 2*, (3 Apr. 1999 [14/1/1378]).

(88) The daily *Manteq-e-Azad* was compelled to let go of its chief editor, A. Zeid Abadi, to meet the demand of Mohajerani, the Minister of Culture and Islamic Guidance. The chief editor was blamed for having published extracts from an open letter of the students of the University of Science and Industry on the events of 20 May 1999. *Payam-e Emrooz* 31, (Jun.-Jul. 1999 [tir 1378]): 28-29.

(89) The Revolutionary Court ordered the ban of the daily *Zan* on 7 April 1999. *Salam*, (8 Apr. 1999 [19/1/1378]).

(90) *Hamshahri*, (29 Sep. 1998 [7/7/1377]).

(91) A fervent revolutionary activist and formerly in charge of the Ideology Office of the Revolutionary Guards, Akbar Ganji was arrested and judged by the Revolutionary Court on February 18, 1998 for a discourse in which he had compared the conservatives to fascists. *Salam* (18 Feb.1998 [29/11/1376]). Ganji was again arrested in 21 Apr. 2000, (92) *Payam-e Emrooz* 29, (Mar.-Apr. 1999 [farvardin 1378]): 20.

(93) "Saïd Eslami is the initiator of the reform of the Press Law", *Salam*, (6 Jul. 1999 [15/4/1378]).

(94) *Salam* was banned on 7 July 1999, the day following the publishing of the article on the press. On 25 July 1999 *Salam's* publisher Khomeiniha was found guilty by the Special Clergy Court. *IRNA* (25 Jul. 1999 [3/5/1378]).

(95) See *Payam-e Emrooz* 29, (Mar.-Apr. 1999 [farvardin 1378]): 19-21.

(96) Interestingly, the prosecutor interprets the fact that the angle of justice is blindfolded, symbolizing impartiality, as an insult to justice: "it is implying that the judicial power is violent, cruel, lacking in judgment and blind." *Payam-e Emrooz* 24, (May-Jun. 1998 [khordad 1377]): 41-48

(97) Mohajerani, A. "Speech in the Parliament", 1 May 1999 (11/2/1378), *Hamshahri*, (2 May 1999 [12/2/1378]). Three members of *Tous'* staff were arrested by the Revolutionary Court. They are all part of the oligarchy. One of the paper's directors, Jalaï-Pour, is the brother of three war martyrs, which is a great privilege in the Islamic Republic.

(98) "Truly, *Neshat* is much different form *Jame'eh* and *Tous*; it seems that it procedes more carefully." Mohajerani, A. "Speech in the Parliament", 1 May 1999 (11/2/1378), *Hamshahri*, (2 May 1999 [12/2/1378]).

(99) Bagher-Zadeh, H. "Is State Violence legitimate?", *Neshat*, (24 Aug. 1999 [2/6/1378])

(100) Baghi, E. "The death penalty and lex Talionis", *Neshat*, (30 Aug. 1999 [8/6/1378]).

(101) Khamenei, A. *Neshat*, (2 Sep. 1999 [11/6/1378]).

(102) The last issue of *Neshat* (no 149) is dated 3 September 1999 (12/6/1378), *Payam-e Emrooz* 35, (Nov.-Dec. 1999 [azar 1378]): 31-34.

(103) On the revolutionary credential of the press notables see Mohajerani, A. "Speech in the Parliament", 1 May 1999 (11/2/1378), *Hamshahri*, (2 May 1999 [12/2/1378]).

(104) Youssefi Ashkevari, H. "In Which World Do We Live?" *Asr Azadegan*, (8 Nov. 1999 [17/8/1378]).

(105) Mohajerani, A. "Speech in the Islamic Parliament", 1 May 1999 (11/2/1378), *Hamshahri*, (2 may 1999 [12/2/1378]))

(106) Khatami, M. "Speech at Tehran University", 29 September 1998, *Hamshahri*, (30 Sep. 1998 [8/7/1378]).

(107) On the metamorphosis of the insider into an outsider see, Shariatmadari, H. daily *Kayhan*, (8 Aug. 1999 [17/5/1378]).

(108) Nouri, A. *Shokaran-e Eslah (the hemlock of reform Defense of Abdollah Nouri before the Special Court of Clergy)*, Tarhe No, (5th edition), Tehran, 1999: 238.

(109) On the victims' heterodox opinions, see Hosseini, R. *Kayhan*, (11 January 1999 [21/10/1377]).

(110) See Nouri, A. *Shokaran-e Eslah...*, *op. cit.*: 79-80. See also Ganji, A. "Alijenab-e khakestari (The Gray eminence)", in *Tarikkhaneh Ashbah (Darkroom of Ghosts)*, *op. cit.*: 394-398.

(111) Ganji, A. "the ideological justification of a crime", *ibid.*: 32-35.

(112) "The constitution can be criticizable because it is neither the word of God, nor that of an immaculate saint... to express an opinion on the constitution is neither a fault nor a conspiracy." Nouri, A. "Speech at Tehran University", October 13, 1998, *Salam*, (14 Oct. 1998 [22/7/1377]). See also Ganji, A. *Naqdi bar tamam-e Fosuls (A critique for all seasons)*, *op. cit.*: 93-94.

(113) Khatami, M. "Speech at Tehran University", September 29, 1998, *Hamshahri*, (30 Sep. 1998 [8/7/1377]).

(114) "The peace of mind of the leader is important for all as the calm and stability of the entire system originates from the leader's peace of mind. Therefore, he stressed, leader's concerns [allusion to Khamenei's diatribe against the reformist press, which resulted in the closure of more than a dozen of newspapers and periodicals] should be identified and all efforts should be directed towards elimination of those concerns..." Khatami, M. quoted by *IRNA*, (24 Apr. 2000 [5/2/1379]).

(115) "Freedom of thought for ever for ever" ; "It is impossible to confiscate ideas by the force of canon and tank". See "The assault against the university's dormitory from the beginning to the end; five days of turbulence and the sixth day," *Payam-e-Emrooz* 32, (July-August 1999 [mordad 1378]): 6-27.

(116) Khatami, M. "Speech in Hamadan", *IRNA*, (25 Jul. 1999 [3/5/1378]).

(117) "Speech on the tomb of Ayatollah Khomeini for the school opening", *Resalat*, (30 Sep. 1999 [8/7/1378]).

(118) *CNN World*, 26 April 2000 Web posted at: 9:58 p.m. EDT (0458 GMT)

(119) News conference held by the Office of Consolidating Unity, a pro-Khatami student group, Jonathan Lyons, *Reuters*, 20 July 1999.

(120) H. Leylaz, *Neshat*, (27 Jul. 1999 [5/5/1378]).